

Name scheme: ISPO

- References
- Presentation:** "ISPO Current Progress and Future Challenges", Secretariat ISPO Commission
 - Thesis:** WUR (2018), Creating Legitimacy for the Indonesian Sustainable Palm Oil Certification Scheme
 - Report:** Forest peoples, a comparison of leading palm oil standards
 - Report:** UNDP - Joint Study on the Similarities and Differences of the ISPO and the RSPO Certification Systems (2015)
 - Communication:** with Sawit-Watch (via email)
 - Report:** Daemeter (2014), a comparison of leading palm oil certification standards applied in Indonesia, may 2014, Full report
 - Article:** Sustainable Standard for Sustainable Palm Oil (ISPO), (2018), Hidayat, Ofemans and Glasbergen, In Agriculture and Human Values

Scores	Interpretation
5	Strong
4	Good
3	Medium
2	Weak / non-compliant / non-existent
1	Information missing / not accessible
0	Not applicable / relevant
n.a.	Yes or no - This gives <u>no indication</u> of the level of compliance; but indicates whether this element is part of the standard.

Assurance requirements

Scheme requirements

Score

Accreditation

<p>The accreditation or oversight body is independent from the scheme owner. It is responsible for decisions on the accreditation status of a certification body, including application, approval, suspension or termination.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Presentation "ISPO Current Progress and Future Challenges", Secretariat ISPO Commission The certification body is accredited by National Accreditation Committee and approved by ISPO Commission. * Thesis: WUR (2018), Creating Legitimacy for ISPO The Ministry of Agriculture, through the Directorate General (DG) of Estate Crops has the responsibility over the 'on farm' palm oil production. As mentioned before, the Ministry of Agriculture is also the owner the ISPO scheme. 5.2.4.1 Revision of ISPO's organisational structure ...[...]. The ISPO Secretariat is thus the agency that owns the ISPO scheme, hands out ISPO certificates, appoints the auditors that monitor ISPO certified companies and even checks the auditing reports . Within the ISPO Strengthening process however, it is believed that the ISPO Secretariat holds too much authority regarding the ISPO certification scheme. Therefore within the ISPO Strengthening process a new organisational structure is proposed, by the ISPO Strengthening working team, that attempts to decouple responsibilities from the ISPO secretariat and to shift the lead over the ISPO certification system towards the Ministry of Economic Affairs ...[...]. Under the new organisational structure of the ISPO, as proposed by the ISPO Strengthening process, a Steering Committee will be established that will be led by the Minister of Economic Affairs. This will replace the current ISPO Commission led by the Ministry of Agriculture as the authority governing the ISPO. ...[...]. In addition, the authority to accredit auditors is transferred from the current ISPO Secretariat to the KAN. ...[...]. * Forest Peoples - certification standards There is 1) An assessment of compliance by an independent approved accreditor. 2) A certification body that has been accredited by the Accreditation Board 3) A certification and/or association that undertakes auditing is officially registered in Indonesia according to national regulations. A certification body must obtain the approval of accreditation by National Accreditation Committee (KAN). ISPO Certification Bodies are accredited directly by the ISPO Commission. (not independent of ISPO) - the ISPO maintains a high level of control over the entire certification process from standard setting through to certification decisions. * UNDP - Joint study ISPO and RSPO The ISPO and RSPO both require that the Certification Body has implemented ISPO 17021-2011 concerning the requirements for Certification Bodies providing auditing and certification of management systems and/or ISPO/IEC 17065 concerning the requirements for certifying products, processes, and services. The distinction is in the organization that gives the approval. ISPO Certification Bodies are accredited directly by the ISPO Commission, whilst RSPO certification bodies are accredited by ASI without approval required by the RSPO * Email communication SAWIT-Watch The process is currently underway to improve and strengthen the ISPO mechanism which began in June 2016 led by the Coordinating Ministry for Economic Affairs. Decree of the Secretary of the Coordinating Ministry for Economic Affairs Number 54 of 2016 concerning the ISPO Certification System Strengthening Team, the ISPO Strengthening Team was formed. T...[...].An important component in the ISPO Presidential Regulation Draft is: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> improving governance of ISPO Certification by opening space for participation, accountability and transparency; rearranging the ISPO Commission's institution in terms of membership, duties, functions and integrity of the ISPO Commission; put the function of the National Accreditation Committee in the ISPO certification system; strengthen Certification Bodies as credible independent institutions; ...[...]. The President Regulation on Indonesia Sustainable Palm Oil is expecting will be issued on February 2019. Previously ISPO just based on Ministry of Agriculture Regulation Number 19 year 2011 and renewed with Ministry of Agriculture Regulation Number 11 year 2015. 	<p>1 (7)</p>
<p>Accreditation of certification bodies takes place through one of the following approaches:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Accreditation by a national accreditation body affiliated to the International Accreditation Forum (IAF) or; * Accreditation by a full member of associate member of ISAL or; * Certification bodies accredited by Accreditation Services International (ASI) * Accreditation by bodies having a bilateral agreement with the European co-operation for Accreditation (EA) or; * Certification bodies accredited by American National Standards Institute (ANSI) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Presentation "ISPO Current Progress and Future Challenges", Secretariat ISPO Commission Certification assessment done by third party which is certification body. The certification body is accredited by National Accreditation Committee and approved by ISPO Commission. * Thesis: WUR (2018), Creating Legitimacy for ISPO 5.2.4.1 Revision of ISPO's organisational structure ...[...]. Under the new organisational structure of the ISPO, as proposed by the ISPO Strengthening process, a Steering Committee will be established that will be led by the Minister of Economic Affairs. ...[...]. In addition, the authority to accredit auditors is transferred from the current ISPO Secretariat to the KAN. KAN is an 'independent governmental body' that has been entrusted to govern the accreditation process for the certification of other products such as cacao and timber * Forest Peoples - certification standards There is 1) An assessment of compliance by an independent approved accreditor. 2) A certification body that has been accredited by the Accreditation Board 3) A certification and/or association that undertakes auditing is officially registered in Indonesia according to national regulations. A certification body must obtain the approval of accreditation by National Accreditation Committee (KAN). ISPO Certification Bodies are accredited directly by the ISPO Commission. (not independent of ISPO) - the ISPO maintains a high level of control over the entire certification process from standard setting through to certification decisions. 	<p>5</p>
<p>The accreditation organization monitors, conducts review and/or surveillance of accredited certification bodies.</p>		<p>7</p>

Independency of audit

<p>The audits or verifications are carried out by an external third party (not the economic operator). This means that the auditor or verifier is free from conflict of interest, independent of the activity being audited and independent in providing, suspending or withdrawing certificates.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Presentation "ISPO Current Progress and Future Challenges", Secretariat ISPO Commission ISPO Certification system is impartial and independent. Certification assessment done by third party which is certification body. ISPO currently approved 11 certification bodies and acknowledged 800 auditors. * Forest Peoples - certification standards There is 1) An assessment of compliance by an independent approved accreditor. 2) A certification body that has been accredited by the Accreditation Board 3) A certification and/or association that undertakes auditing is officially registered in Indonesia according to national regulations. A certification body must obtain the approval of accreditation by National Accreditation Committee (KAN). * Daemeter (2014) ISPO relies upon accredited third party certification bodies to conduct audits, but the ISPO Commission itself (not the CB) issues certificates based on reviews of audit reports and recommendations provided by the CB. The ISPO commission therefore maintains a high level of control over the entire certification process, from standard setting through to certification decisions. 	<p>1</p>
---	--	----------

Selection of and requirements to certification bodies

<p>The certification bodies to undertake audits on behalf of the scheme and the procedure to select or exclude certification bodies shall be described by the scheme owner</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Presentation "ISPO Current Progress and Future Challenges", Secretariat ISPO Commission The secretariat of ISPO Commission function to supervise the activities of certification bodies and auditors. ISPO currently approved 11 certification bodies and acknowledged 800 auditors. The certification body is accredited by National Accreditation Committee and approved by ISPO Commission. * Email communication SAWIT-Watch In 2017, ISPO has recognized 12 certification body and 1.184 auditor, 8 consultant, and 1 trainer. 	<p>7</p>
<p>The scheme owner requires certification bodies to be compliant with ISO/IEC 17065, ISO/IEC 17021, ISO/IEC 17000 or equivalent</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * UNDP - Joint study ISPO and RSPO The ISPO and RSPO both require that the Certification Body has implemented ISPO 17021-2011 concerning the requirements for Certification Bodies providing auditing and certification of management systems and/or ISPO/IEC 17065 concerning the requirements for certifying products, processes, and services. The distinction is in the organization that gives the approval. ISPO Certification Bodies are accredited directly by the ISPO Commission, whilst RSPO certification bodies are accredited by ASI without approval required by the RSPO. 	<p>5</p>
<p>There are quality requirements (competences) for auditors documented by the scheme.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Forest Peoples report - palm oil certification standards ISPO audit teams should consist of auditors who understand licensing requirements, palm oil plantations, good management practices, occupational health and safety systems, have an awareness of environmental, social and economic issues. They should speak Indonesian, and understand ISO 19011 on managing audit systems. ISPO auditors must also pass a training course organised by the ISPO Commission and run by a training institution approved by ISPO commission. 	<p>5</p>

Standard requirements and compliance levels of standard

<p>The certification standards of the voluntary scheme are revised at least every five years.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> UNDP (2015) Joint study ISPO - RSPO The Assessment Standard of ISPO in this study refers to the Revised Minister of Agriculture Regulation Number 11/Permentan/OT.1403/2015 on the Certification System of the Indonesian Sustainable Palm Oil and its appendices. The ISPO is reviewed every time there is a change in relevant existing regulations. 	<p>5</p>
<p>The certification standard clearly distinguishes mandatory requirements from recommendations and guidance.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Daemeter (2014) RSPO and ISPO provide 'indicators' and 'guidance' for each criterion. These indicators describe the types of records or proof necessary to demonstrate compliance. The guidance sections provide additional instruction and interpretation of criteria. ...[...]. ISPO relies implicitly on Indonesian laws and regulations to provide further detail on standard requirements (but in its final published version does not provide direct reference to laws and regulations relevant to each principle or criterion). 	<p>5</p>

<p>Requirements for compliance to achieve certification</p> <p>The sustainability criteria need to be fully complied with (100%) over a defined timeline. A certain flexibility is possible for economic operators with small scale, low intensity and/or low risk.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Presentation "ISPO Current Progress and Future Challenges", Secretariat ISPO Commission <p>Standard of ISPO now should be implement by:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Plantation companies; 2. Plantation only with no mill; 3. Mill with no plantation; 4. Plasma smallholders; 5. Independent smallholders; 6. CPO to use as renewable energy <p>Every category has its own standard, for CPO for renewable energy additional criteria is added and the company have to Calculate GHG Emission. The implementation of Standard No. 1, 2 and 3 is mandatory, while the remaining are voluntary.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Presentation "ISPO Current Progress and Future Challenges", Secretariat ISPO Commission <p>Growers certification: The growers can issue certificate if the production full ISPO criteria, sustainability percentage depend on buyers demand. ISPO CPO for renewable Energy certificate can be issue if request by buyers (ISPO put legal requirements as priority requirements especially on land, environment and human rights. If the company do not comply to legal requirements, it will be impose by penalty</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Thesis: WUR (2018), Creating Legitimacy for ISPO <p>The ISPO combines about 200 laws and regulations, from all ministries involved with palm oil, in its seven principles and 46 criteria. [...] Since the ISPO scheme consists of governmental laws and regulations, becoming ISPO certified is mandatory for plantation companies. Under the current scheme, certification is still voluntary for smallholders until 2020, afterwards they must become certified as well. [...] If a company receives ISPO certification it has the duty to ensure the certification of its plasma smallholders do have to adhere to six of the seven ISPO Principles, excluding principle three regarding the protection of conservation areas within their estate. If a company receives ISPO certification it has the duty to ensure the certification of its plasma smallholders within two years and also provide for the training and costs that are involved. Independent smallholders need to meet four of the ISPO Principles, additionally excluding the principles five and six on responsibility to workers and social responsibility and community economic empowerment.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * UNDP (2015) Joint study ISPO - ISPO <p>The ISPO Certification System is compulsory for plantation companies conducting cultivation integrated with processing facilities, plantation companies conducting cultivation, and plantation companies processing estate crops.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Daemeter (2014): [...].ISPO require full compliance with all criteria in order to be certified, or an approved time-bound plan for addressing minor non-compliances. 	
--	--	--

<p>YES/NO</p> <p>The scheme has a progressive entry level (this means 100% compliance with the criteria is not required from the start but should be reached over time)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Thesis: WUR (2018), Creating Legitimacy for ISPO <p>The ISPO combines about 200 laws and regulations, from all ministries involved with palm oil, in its seven principles and 46 criteria. [...] Since the ISPO scheme consists of governmental laws and regulations, becoming ISPO certified is mandatory for plantation companies. Under the current scheme, certification is still voluntary for smallholders until 2020, afterwards they must become certified as well. [...] If a company receives ISPO certification it has the duty to ensure the certification of its plasma smallholders within two years and also provide for the training and costs that are involved. [...].</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Article Hidayat Oeffemans and Glasbergen (2018) <p>The ISPO standard is currently compulsory for companies, and will become compulsory for smallholders in 2022</p>	<p>YES (timeline for reaching certification)</p>
--	--	--

<p>In case of a progressive entry level, the scheme owner has set clear requirements on how to increase the percentage of compliance over time.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Thesis: WUR (2018), Creating Legitimacy for ISPO <p>...[...]. Currently (as of April 2018) 617 Indonesian companies have been ISPO certified, whereas only two smallholder groups have been certified yet (ISPO, 2018). [...].</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Thesis: WUR (2018), Creating Legitimacy for ISPO <p>The ISPO combines about 200 laws and regulations, from all ministries involved with palm oil, in its seven principles and 46 criteria. [...] Since the ISPO scheme consists of governmental laws and regulations, becoming ISPO certified is mandatory for plantation companies. Under the current scheme, certification is still voluntary for smallholders until 2020, afterwards they must become certified as well. [...] If a company receives ISPO certification it has the duty to ensure the certification of its plasma smallholders within two years and also provide for the training and costs that are involved. [...].</p>	<p>17</p>
---	---	-----------

Scope of certification at farm producer level

<p>External audits take place on a producer unit level (farm level). The audit scope is the full production unit. The producer level is the first point of certification in the chain of custody.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * UNDP (2015) - Joint study ISPO and RSPO <p>For the ISPO, the certification units are plantation companies conducting cultivation integrated with processing facilities, plantation companies conducting cultivation, plantation companies processing estate crops, plasma smallholdings, independent smallholdings, and plantation companies producing crude palm oil for renewable energy. Each unit to be certified has to be legally registered.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Presentation "ISPO Current Progress and Future Challenges", Secretariat ISPO Commission <p>Standard of ISPO now should be implement by:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Plantation companies; 2. Plantation only with no mill; 3. Mill with no plantation; 4. Plasma smallholders; 5. Independent smallholders; 6. CPO to use as renewable energy <p>Every category has its own standard, for CPO for renewable energy additional criteria is added and the company have to Calculate GHG Emission. The implementation of Standard No. 1, 2 and 3 is mandatory, while the remaining are voluntary.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Daemeter report (2014), ISPO certification is mandatory for any plantation or mill operating in Indonesia. The holding company can be the unit of certification for plantations and mills if the holding company can ensure that all of the plantations and mills use the same management system and the holding company takes full responsibility for their compliance (Lampiran 1: 19/Permentan/OT.140/3/2011, Section 2.7(2)). [...]. 	
---	---	--

<p>Partial certification of the farm area is not possible. Producers are required to certify their whole unit of certification, which shall include owned land, leased and rented land.</p>		<p>2 (on national level, due to legal timelines)</p>
---	--	--

<p>Organisations are required to certify all (eligible) units under their control in accordance with a time-bound plan. This means that all subsidiaries of a parent company required to become certified (in time) against the P&C requirements.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Daemeter report (2014) ISPO certification is mandatory for any plantation or mill operating in Indonesia. The holding company can be the unit of certification for plantations and mills if the holding company can ensure that all of the plantations and mills use the same management system and the holding company takes full responsibility for their compliance (Lampiran 1: 19/Permentan/OT.140/3/2011, Section 2.7(2)). [...]. * Thesis: WUR (2018), Creating Legitimacy for ISPO <p>...[...]. If a company receives ISPO certification it has the duty to ensure the certification of its plasma smallholders within two years and also provide for the training and costs that are involved. [...].</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Daemeter (2014): ISPO does not explicitly prohibit partial certification of subsidiaries owned by a holding company, but since all companies operating in Indonesia are required to become certified, partial certification is, by default, prohibited under ISPO. [...]. <p>Originally, all palm oil companies licensed to operate in Indonesia as of February 2011 were required to become certified against ISPO requirements by December 2014. As of January 2014, 150 of Indonesia's estimated 1500 palm oil companies had registered to initiate ISPO certification audit, and 41 had received certification. Recent statements reported in the media indicate government is considering extending the 2014 deadline, due in part to capacity limitations for implementing certification audits and decisions. ISPO does not explicitly prohibit partial certification of subsidiaries owned by a holding company, but since all companies operating in Indonesia are required to become certified, partial certification is, by default, prohibited under ISPO.</p>	<p>3 (on national level, due to legal compliance)</p>
---	---	---

<p>Outsourcing of activities: The activities of third parties as outsourced activities fall in the scope of certification, and they shall fully comply with the relevant requirements of the standard.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * UNDP (2015) - Joint study ISPO and RSPO <p>For the ISPO, the certification units are plantation companies conducting cultivation integrated with processing facilities, plantation companies conducting cultivation, plantation companies processing estate crops, plasma smallholdings, independent smallholdings, and plantation companies producing crude palm oil for renewable energy. Each unit to be certified has to be legally registered.</p>	<p>7 (07)</p>
--	--	---------------

Complaints mechanism

<p>Certification bodies have formal and transparent, publicly available procedures in place for handling disputes and complaints related to certification and surveillance.</p>	<p>Not clear. There are some requirements under ISO/IEC 17021</p>	<p>07 (partly covered under ISO7)</p>
--	---	---------------------------------------

<p>The scheme owner has formal and transparent, publicly available procedures in place for handling disputes and complaints related to conflicts resulting from the relationship between a certification body and the organization or entity to be certified.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Forest peoples - palm oil certification standards <p>There is a complaint System, complaints and grievances can be addressed to the Secretariat of the ISPO Commission but ISPO does not provide a measures indicator that provides documentation of the grievance process when the dispute was results and where the results shall be available. ISPO has no system indicators applicable for identifying people entitled to compensation. ISPO does not have an indicator that there shall be a system for calculating and distributing for compensation. There is no time line for follow-up nor is a mechanism for independent investigation mentioned. To solve land related conflicts, the National Land Board has a Land Dispute and Conflict Assessment and Handling department.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Joint study UNDP (2015) ISPO and RSPO <p>For ISPO, complaints and grievances can be addressed to the Secretariat of the ISPO Commission.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Email communication SAWIT-MASO <p>If there is any complaint against the certified unit (company, mills, group of company, dependent and or independent smallholders), the complainant should send formal document including formal evidence and proposed solution to Chairman of ISPO Commission through ISPO Secretariat. Once the complaint has been verified in ISPO Secretariat, the Chairman will set up a Complaint Settlement Committee which consist of 2 person representing ISPO Committee and 1 expert. The committee needs to declare free conflict of interest. They should completing the all process within 1 months and the result will be submit to Chairman to be decide. Decision of Chairman will deliver to the party through ISPO Commission secretariat.</p> <p>While the party do not accept the decision, they can make appeal. Appeal Panel adopts the arbitration mechanism and is ad hoc in nature. This panel formed by Chairman of ISPO based on the commission meeting results. Appeal Panel is consist of 3 persons: 2 from ISPO commission and 1 from external expert. The chairman of commission can assign 1 person from ISPO Secretariat as Secretary without voting rights. The party who asked for appeal needs to deposit some funds to the state.</p> <p>If violation is proven, the ISPO certificate will be suspend for 3 months. If it can be proven that the repair process has been carried out, the certificate can be reactivated, but if not, the ISPO certificate will be revoked.</p> <p>As well as the progress of handling disputes by the complaint system</p>	<p>07</p>
--	--	-----------

Auditing (frequency) and risk assessment

<p>There is a documented assessment methodology for certification bodies on how to assess compliance with the standards of the voluntary scheme</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Article Hidayat Oeffemans and Glasbergen (2018) <p>ISPO's certification process starts with a plantation classification by the local government. In this classification, the local government assesses the extent to which plantations comply with the national regulations and meet the standard regarding plantation management. Only plantations that score well in this assessment (classified as 1st to 3rd class companies) can formally enter the process towards ISPO certification; poor performing plantations can adjust their practices and start a new classification procedure afterwards. Well-performing companies can request certification by submitting documents to an independent certification body. The latter will then verify the documents, perform field assessments, and report the final evaluation to the ISPO commission and ISPO's assessment team</p>	<p>1 (1)</p>
---	---	--------------

<p>As a general rule, a voluntary scheme should ensure that economic operators are audited before allowing them to participate in the scheme. Producer members (if applicable) should commit to the standard's P&C</p>	<p>* Presentation "ISPO Current Progress and Future Challenges", Secretariat ISPO Commission Pre-certification requirement Prior to ISPO certification of oil palm plantation and its mill shall be assessed in accordance to Minister of Agriculture Regulation No.02/2009 on Guidelines for plantation Business Assessment. Oil palm plantation will be assessed on the following criteria: - Legal permit; Plantation management; Processing; Social economy; Environment; Reporting The plantation will be classified into Class I, II, III, IV and V. Only oil palm plantation classified as Class I, II, and III are eligible to apply for ISPO certification, and submit the application by the end of September 2015. * Forest Peoples - Palm oil certification standards The ISPO audit is undertaken in two stages, the first stage is a compliance audit of the requisite legal plantation licenses and required completed business documentation. The second stage is a full plantation audit assessing all documentation concerning adherence to ISPO P2C's in the plantation and in the mill. The certification body must extend a public announcement via the ISPO Secretariat at least 30 days before the second stage of the auditing process so as to receive any input or complaints from any interested party concerning the plantation in question. * Article Hidayat Offermans and Glasbergen (2018) ISPO certification process starts with a plantation classification by the local government. In this classification, the local government assesses the extent to which plantations comply with the national regulations and meet the standard regarding plantation management. Only plantations that score well in this assessment (classified as 1st to 3rd class companies) can formally enter the process towards ISPO certification; poor performing plantations can adjust their practices and start a new classification procedure afterwards. Well-performing companies can request certification by submitting documents to an independent certification body. The latter will then verify the documents, perform field assessments, and report the final evaluation to the ISPO commission and ISPO's assessment team</p>	
--	---	--

<p>Certification bodies are required to conduct annual or more frequent surveillance audits of certificate holders.</p>	<p>* Forest Peoples - Palm oil certification standards The ISPO audit is undertaken in two stages, the first stage is a compliance audit of the requisite legal plantation licenses and required completed business documentation. The second stage is a full plantation audit assessing all documentation concerning adherence to ISPO P2C's in the plantation and in the mill... * Joint study UNDP (2015) ISPO - RSPQ In the ISPO certification system, surveillance has to be undertaken every year and the first surveillance audit has to be conducted at least within one year from the time the ISPO certificate was granted by the ISPO Commission.</p>	
---	---	--

<p>The audit is based in part on a risk assessment of the client. Certification bodies are required to adjust the intensity of auditing and surveillance to match observations in the field.</p>		
--	--	--

<p>The scheme owner requires economic operators (and/or its members) to allow unannounced audits. Certification bodies conduct unannounced audits</p>		
---	--	--

<p>Certificates are valid for no more than five years after which a new full certification audit is required.</p>	<p>* UNDP (2015) - Joint study ISPO - RSPQ The validity period of the certificate in both the RSPQ and ISPO certification systems are for five years from the date of the issuance of the certificate.</p>	
---	--	--

Stakeholder consultation

<p>Certification bodies are required to proactively consult with affected stakeholders during both certification and surveillance audits.</p>	<p>* Thesis: WUR (2018). Creating Legitimacy for ISPO [...] within the NAP and ISPO Strengthening processes some "international" norms and values such as the multi-stakeholder and consultation procedures have (partly) been incorporated... In the international arena, the multi-stakeholder and consultation procedures were used, for the NAP and the Strengthening ISPO processes, to be seen as legitimate internationally... * Forest Peoples - Palm oil certification standards The ISPO audit is undertaken in two stages... The certification body must extend a public announcement via the ISPO Secretariat at least 30 days before the second stage of the auditing process so as to receive any input or complaints from any interested party concerning the plantation in question. * Forest Peoples - palm oil certification standards A requirement under Indonesian law involves "public consultation with the relevant stakeholders". According to Law Number 32 of 2009 concerning the Protection and Management of the Environment, for land larger than 3.000 hectares, it is compulsory to have an environmental Impact Assessment (AMDAL) and Social Impact Assessment, something which ISPO standard adheres to. This said, it is a one-off consultation and does not require formal public consultations at each audit. If land conflicts do arise, it is up to the National Land Board to manage land issues and community related conflicts. * Email communication with SAWIT-WATCH In Indonesia, SIA document is attached in one document together with AMDAL. So SIA is not recognized as different part of AMDAL</p>	1
---	--	---

Non-conformities and sanctions

<p>The scheme owner has a procedure in place which describes how certification bodies are required to address non-conformities, including when a certificate or license is suspended or revoked. The scheme should describe what the implications are for any non-conformities identified during the audit.</p>	<p>* UNDP (2015) - Joint study ISPO and RSPQ For the ISPO, the certification body may issue the ISPO certificate only after approval by the ISPO Commission's decision. However, the decision to issue an RSPQ certification can be undertaken directly by the certification committee of a Certification Body that has already been accredited by the AS. * Email communication SAWIT-Watch In the audit process for certification unit, the auditor or assessor found "non compliance" to the ISPO P&C, the certification unit will get 6 months to improve and after that they will re-audited with same auditor... * Article Hidayat Offermans and Glasbergen (2018) In case of a positive evaluation, the ISPO commission approves the certification body to grant certification to the plantation. ISPO's certificate is valid for 5 years. Certified plantations receive an annual surveillance and can extend their certificate 1 year before it expires. In case of a negative evaluation, companies will be requested to rectify within 6 months. If they do not succeed, a re-audit should be done with the same certification body. According to regulation of the Ministry of Agriculture No. 11/2015, companies who refuse or forget to request certification will be downgraded to Grade IV automatically. This implies that their license will eventually be revoked * UNDP (2015) - Joint study ISPO - RSPQ The mechanism of issuing a certificate for the ISPO and RSPQ certification system are different... For the ISPO certification system, all indicators must be met because the ISPO P&C is based upon existing, compulsory Indonesian regulations. * Email communication SAWIT-Watch In the audit process for certification unit, the auditor or assessor found "non compliance" to the ISPO P&C, the certification unit will get 6 months to improve and after that they will re-audited with same auditor... Where the implication of sanction is revocation of license, it mean that the company doesn't have any legal basis to run their operation. The following question is: how about status of the license or area that were operated by this company? Legal consequences is not clearly mentioned, whether the land will return to the state? whether the state will offer the concession to other party through open auction? or ...</p>	2
---	---	---

<p>Certificate holders are required to rectify non-compliances identified during certification and surveillance audits within a set timeframe that does not exceed one year.</p>	<p>* Email communication SAWIT-Watch In the audit process for certification unit, the auditor or assessor found "non compliance" to the ISPO P&C, the certification unit will get 6 months to improve and after that they will re-audited with same auditor... * Email communication SAWIT-Watch</p>	
--	--	--

<p>Severe (major) non-compliances that are not rectified in time lead to suspension or termination of the certificate</p>	<p>* Presentation "ISPO Current Progress and Future Challenges", Secretariat ISPO Commission ISPO put legal requirements as priority requirements especially on land, environment and human rights. If the company do not comply to legal requirements, it will be impose by penalty * Thesis: WUR (2018). Creating Legitimacy for ISPO 5.2.4.1 Revision of ISPO's organisational structure [...] Under the new organisational structure of the ISPO, as proposed by the ISPO Strengthening process, a Steering Committee will be established that will be led by the Minister of Economic Affairs... Besides the certification companies gain the authority to freeze or revoke the ISPO certificate of a plantation company or smallholder organisation * Email communication SAWIT-Watch [...] If violation [during appeal / complaint procedure] is proven, the ISPO certificate will be suspended for 3 months. If it can be proven that the repair process has been carried out, the certificate can be reactivated, but if not, the ISPO certificate will be revoked. * Article Hidayat Offermans and Glasbergen (2018) [...] In case of a negative evaluation, companies will be requested to rectify within 6 months. If they do not succeed, a re-audit should be done with the same certification body. According to regulation of the Ministry of Agriculture No. 11/2015, companies who refuse or forget to request certification will be downgraded to Grade IV automatically. This implies that their license will eventually be revoked... we observe that the ISPO commission lacks authority to enforce sanctions for non-compliance with ISPO standard. Sanctioning (i.e., lowering the Plantation Grade and revocation of the Plantation's Permit belongs to the responsibility of local governments (Governor or Bupati/Walikota). Following from this, we can state that Indonesia's decentralization policies (see for example Firman 2009; Hadiz 2004) increase ISPO's inability to enforce sanctions as local governments are allowed to make decisions in the domain of agriculture independent from the National government. Patron-client relationships (see Kolstad and Sævieste 2009; Varkkey 2013) and economic considerations may further demotivate local governments to execute punishments... * Email communication with SAWIT-W Where the implication of sanction is revocation of license, it mean that the company doesn't have any legal basis to run their operation. The following question is: how about status of the license or area that were operated by this company? Legal consequences is not clearly mentioned, whether the land will return to the state? whether the state will offer the concession to other party through open auction? or ...</p>	0
---	--	---

<p>Adequate sanctions are applied in situations where less severe (minor) non-compliances are not rectified in time.</p>	<p>There is no mentioning about minor non-compliances. For the ISPO certification system, all indicators must be met because the ISPO P&C is based upon existing, compulsory Indonesian regulations.</p>	NA?
--	--	-----

Group certification / verification

The scheme allows for group certification or verification	<p>* Presentation "ISPO Current Progress and Future Challenges", Secretariat ISPO Commission</p> <p>Standard of ISPO now should be implement by:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Plantation companies 2. Plantation only with no mill 3. Mill with no plantation 4. Plasma smallholders 5. Independent smallholders 6. CPO to use as renewable energy <p>Every category has its own standard, for CPO for renewable energy additional criteria is added and the company have to Calculate GHG Emission. The implementation of Standard No. 1, 2 and 3 is mandatory, while the remaining are voluntary.</p> <p>* Thesis: WJUR (2018). Creating Legitimacy for ISPO</p> <p>...1.1. Currently (as of April 2018) 137 Indonesian companies have been ISPO certified, whereas only two smallholder groups have been certified yet (ISPO, 2018). [...].</p> <p>* Article Hidayat Oeffarman and Glasbergen (2018)</p> <p>ISPO requires smallholders to be organized under a cooperative, which implies that farmers currently belonging to a farmer group (GAPOKTAN) or association have to expand or change their organizational membership.</p>	YES
There is a sample size formula to determine the number of group members that is externally verified. The sample is determined by risk level.		?
As a minimum, it is required that a sample of at least the square root of the number of group members is audited individually annually (in line with the ISAL standard P035).		?
The group is lead and supervised by a legal entity. This entity is managed by a group manager, responsible for ensuring that the group complies with the standard.	<p>* Article Hidayat Oeffarman and Glasbergen (2018)</p> <p>ISPO requires smallholders to be organized under a cooperative, which implies that farmers currently belonging to a farmer group (GAPOKTAN) or association have to expand or change their organizational membership.</p> <p>* Email communication SAWIT-Watch</p> <p>ISPO certification is more focused for dependent smallholders, where independent smallholders usually create their own group or union.</p> <p>* Thesis WJUR (2018)</p> <p>* Whereas smallholders are defined by owning plots of less than 25 hectares. In addition, smallholders can be divided in at least two groups, namely independent smallholders and plasma smallholders (or NES). Plasma smallholders engage in a partnership with a company that provides them with land and a fixed price at which they are able to sell their FFB to the company. Independent smallholders however, do not engage in any form of partnership or contract and are free to produce and sell their FFB. In order to strengthen their position (independent) smallholders often engage in a form of smallholder koperasi (cooperative)</p>	?(cooperative)
The group must have an internal quality management system in place, which includes an internal audit system.		?
The requirements on group certification/verification define the conditions under which a group (member) shall be suspended or removed from a group. A group sample cannot be changed (i.e. a single member can be excluded from the group) due to failure of an individual group member.		?
Group auditing for compliance with the scheme's land related criteria is only acceptable when the areas concerned are relatively near each other and have similar characteristics (such as management practices).		?

Cross-recognition

The scheme has signed a mutual recognition agreement with at least one other scheme, or accept other schemes	ISPO is based on Indonesian National Legal Frameworks, which is requiring all of the oil palm players (company, mills, dependent and independent smallholders) obey and comply with all law and regulations.	NO
The cross-recognition is based on a benchmark and on the requirement that the recognized scheme has equitable requirements or higher.	N.A.	N.A.
The scheme owner requires to certification bodies the verification of claims of other relevant (recognized) certification schemes to avoid double counting	N.A.	N.A.

Transparency

The scheme owner makes, or requires certification bodies to make, summary certification/verification reports (with personal and commercially sensitive information removed) publicly available	<p>* Thesis: WJUR (2018). Creating Legitimacy for ISPO</p> <p>5.2.4.1 Revision of ISPO's organisational structure</p> <p>...1.1. Under the new organisational structure of the ISPO, as proposed by the ISPO Strengthening process, a Steering Committee will be established that will be led by the Minister of Economic Affairs [...]. Furthermore, certification companies are empowered to publish their audit reports by themselves, thus without the need to gain approval from the new ISPO Commission or any assessment team besides the certification companies gain the authority to freeze or revoke the ISPO certificate of a plantation company or smallholder organisation</p> <p>* Joint study UNDP (2016) ISPO - RSPO</p> <p>For the ISPO, the certification body may issue the ISPO certificate only after approval by the ISPO Commission's decision. [...]. An edited version of the ISPO audit can be accessed via the ISPO website.</p> <p>* Email communication SAWIT-Watch</p> <p>The process is currently underway to improve and strengthen the ISPO mechanism which began in June 2016 led by the Coordinating Ministry for Economic Affairs. Decree of the Secretary of the Coordinating Ministry for Economic Affairs Number 54 of 2016 concerning the ISPO Certification System Strengthening Team, the ISPO Strengthening Team was formed. T. [...]. An important component in the ISPO Presidential Regulation Draft is:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. improving governance of ISPO Certification by opening space for participation, accountability and transparency; 2. rearranging the ISPO Commission's institution in terms of membership, duties, functions and integrity of the ISPO Commission; 3. put the function of the National Accreditation Committee in the ISPO certification system; 4. strengthen Certification Bodies as credible independent institutions; <p>...1.1. The President Regulation on Indonesia Sustainable Palm Oil is expecting will be issued on February 2019. Previously ISPO just based on Ministry of Agriculture Regulation Number 19 year 2011 and renewed with Ministry of Agriculture Regulation Number 11 year 2015.</p>	0
The scheme owner makes its certificates publicly available (on the website), including withdrawn ones. A database with information about the certified units is publicly available.	Information on the website includes: No. / Company / Unit of Certification / Implementation Certification Institution (Phase I / II) (date).	1
The standard documentation is publicly available. The standard documentation is available in a UN language.	<p>* Thesis: WJUR (2018). Creating Legitimacy for ISPO</p> <p>The ISPO combines about 200 laws and regulations, from all ministries involved with palm oil, in its seven principles and 46 criteria. [...].</p> <p>Standard documentation is available on: http://www.ispo.org.id/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=84&Itemid=248&lang=en</p>	2